



ZACHARY W. CARTER  
*Corporation Counsel*

THE CITY OF NEW YORK  
**LAW DEPARTMENT**  
100 CHURCH STREET  
NEW YORK, NY 10007

BRACHAH GOYKADOSH  
*Assistant Corporation Counsel*  
bgoykado@law.nyc.gov  
Phone: (212) 356-3523  
Fax: (212) 356-1148

January 9, 2017

**By ECF**

Honorable Peggy Kuo  
United States Magistrate Judge  
United States District Court  
Eastern District of New York  
225 Cadman Plaza East  
Brooklyn, New York 11201

Re: Terrence Bruce v. City of New York, et al.  
16-cv-5671 (MKB) (PK)

Re: Justin Murphy et al. v. City of New York, et al.  
16-cv-0519 (MKB) (PK)

Your Honor:

I am an Assistant Corporation Counsel in the Office of Zachary W. Carter, Corporation Counsel of the City of New York, and the attorney assigned to represent Defendants City of New York, Lieutenant Elizabeth Paulson, Sergeant Diana Pichardo, Sergeant Jovanny Calderon, and Police Officer Shawn Nigro in the above-referenced matter (hereinafter "Bruce"). Defendants write to respectfully renew their application to consolidate this matter with Justin Murphy et al., v. City of New York, et al., 16-cv-0519 (MKB) (PK) (hereinafter "Murphy") pursuant to Rule 42(a)(2) of the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure.

On January 4, 2017, Defendants moved to consolidate this matter with Murphy, as both actions allege substantially the same set of facts and concern arrests by the same Defendants, at 2249 Stillwell Avenue, Apartment 4B, on April 6, 2014. (Docket Entry No. 14). Rather than reiterating its reasons herein, Defendants respectfully refer the Court to that application at Docket Entry No. 14. This Court denied the motion without prejudice to renewal as the motion did not state whether the parties in Murphy consented to consolidation. (Docket Entry dated January 5, 2017). Defendants now write to inform the Court that both Defendants and Plaintiffs in Murphy consent to this application.

Accordingly, Defendants respectfully renew their motion for the consolidation of Murphy and Bruce pursuant to Rule 42(a)(2) of the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure.

Thank you for your consideration herein.

Respectfully submitted,



Brachah Goykadosh  
*Assistant Corporation Counsel*  
Special Federal Litigation Division

cc: Honorable Margo K. Brodie (by hand delivery)  
United States District Judge  
United States District Court  
Eastern District of New York  
225 Cadman Plaza East  
Brooklyn, New York 11201

David Bruce Rankin, Esq. (by ECF)  
Rankin & Taylor  
*Attorney for Plaintiff Terrence Bruce*  
11 Park Place, Suite 914  
New York, New York 10007

Ryan Michael Lozar, Esq. (by email and by first-class mail)  
*Attorney for Plaintiffs Justin Murphy, Gregg Liverman, Jeffrey Bush*  
305 Broadway, 10th Floor  
New York, New York 10007

Joshua Matthew Friedman, Esq. (by hand delivery)  
*Attorney for Defendants City of New York, Nigro, Pichardo, and Calderon*  
New York City Law Department  
100 Church Street  
New York, New York 10007